

**From proposal to outcome -  
Self-evaluation of the G9 action**

*Erik Stubkjær*

**Department of Development and Planning, Aalborg University, DK**

**8th and Final Workshop, ESF/COST G9  
Real Estate Planning and Land Law, Royal Institute of Technology,  
Stockholm, 13-15 October 2005**

**Overview**

1. Structure and criteria
2. Quotations from the TECHNICAL ANNEX and comments
3. Summary

**Structure and criteria**

What did we/ the proposal intend, and

- what was accomplished
- what was not accomplished (scope or tasks)
- what was partly accomplished

Dissemination ("deliverables") separately

Criteria: Can be documented in scientific writing

**State-of-the-art in 1999**

- the [textbook] authors take an information system, rather than a legal view of the issue
- the potential for improving efficiency of transactions ... is far from being exploited
- The concept of property rights has different notions with respect to legal theory and economic theory (Sevatdal, 1999)

**The proposal's view of the research domain**

- The transactions regard inter-organisational business workflows, which are stating or changing property rights and parcel lots.
- In order to establish an initial, proven understanding of this field ..restrict..to..European countries
- a multi-disciplinary field, which needs a certain consolidation of a developing cooperation.
- The action will support the development of basic and common elements of the education

**The stated objectives**

- to improve the transparency of real property markets and
- to provide a stronger basis for the reduction of costs of real property transactions
- by preparing a set of models of real property transactions
- which is correct, formalised, and complete according to stated criteria,
- and then assessing the economic efficiency of these transactions.

**..with the following benefits:**

- governments, professions, and holders of property rights get a better basis for reducing the costs of the transactions of the markets of real estates
- The outcome of the comparative analysis can be used for improving the efficiency of the procedures
- the COST action will support Ph.D.-studies by providing a much-needed international research framework and a basis for Ph.D.-level courses.

**Stated methodology, which largely proved feasible**

- Description and comparison of the national variety of forms of land tenure in a way that relates to the major transaction types, and description of these transaction types (conveyance of title, mortgaging, compulsory acquisition, as well as subdivision, etc.)
- Quasi-formal modelling based on the above investigations
- Development of formal methods that are feasible for modelling property transactions with a national scope. Provision for semantic translation between different datasets will be made, with a view to the following comparative analysis.

**Stated methodology, which largely proved feasible**

- Application of the developed methods on few, selected countries: probably Denmark, Sweden, the Netherlands, Austria and Slovenia, and maybe further country(ies)
- studies of literature, occasional visits and interviews to clarify the operation of the ever-developing technical systems. Descriptions are circulated between participating countries, with a view to increase completeness and correctness from a legal point of view.

**Stated research tasks, which did not prove feasible (1)**

- a comparative analysis of the economic efficiency of transactions ..will be presented,
  - supplemented by an exploratory analysis of relations between transaction costs and national practices regarding land management, education and governance
  - will include an identification of these effects and an assessment of their impact on the economic efficiency, including an assessment of the value of transaction information for further purposes.
- the real property transactions, which affect land management, specifically regarding the transition of land use from rural to urban

**Stated research tasks, which did not prove feasible (2)**

- The comparative analysis is followed by an explorative analysis of the causes of economic efficiency. ..
- The effects of the property transactions shall be taken into consideration, with a view to assess the economic efficiency of the transaction processes.
- the development of an economic model of the systems, which contain the most important variables that determine the resource costs of the various systems. These variables will be derived from the analytical apparatus of transaction costs and property rights economics, ...

**Stated research tasks, which were largely not completed**

**(scope: Cadastre)**

- Description and comparison of national land databases (or datasets, if not yet computerised), and updating information flows
- Investigation in quantitative terms of the transactions, and of the content of databases/-datasets.
- Establishment of taxonomies of technical terms

**Stated research tasks, which were largely not completed****(methodology)**

- Members of the working group Ontology is expected to meet for 1-2 periods of 2-3 days at an appropriate research facility, in order to draft alternative ontologies, and to overcome the linguistic differences of sources of evidence.
- confirmation of the overall working plan, including staffing and terms of reference of the mentioned three working groups.

**Stated methodology, which appeared partly feasible**

- Several participants of the action research are expected to learn the formalisation techniques as part of the action, and to develop teaching material during this process
- develop a framework for future information systems
- The validity of the operationalisation of the theoretical constructs in the transaction costs and property right theories will be assessed by means of discussion with relevant colleagues and interviews with informed respondents.
- The outcomes and further presentations are integrated into a preliminary report on the overall findings of the action. The report is critically examined during the workshop.

**Dissemination - Completed**

- brought to the attention of the Working Party on Land Administration (Delft, 2002)
- Chairpersons are expected to report findings to professional societies (~), e.g. the International Federation of Surveyors (FIG), the International Real Estate Federation (FIABCI), and the International Union of Latin Notaries (IULN).
- 2 or 3 scientific articles will be submitted to peer refereed journals (+, and Delft book)
- Action outcome will be disseminated in a document (YES) that relates company interests with activities of the InternalMarket DG at the closing of the action

**Dissemination - Not completed**

- Representatives of taxation authorities will be invited (-)
- The formal models (ontologies) developed will be made available through the website (~)...
- More specifically, a planned web portal will (-)
  1. provide structured access to information resources of the domain, and
  2. include a reference library of the ontologies, ..

**..In addition to specific research outcomes**

The proposal stated the need

- "to establish an initial, proven understanding of this field"
- "a multi-disciplinary field, which needs .. consolidation of a developing cooperation"
- "The action will support the development of ..[research].. education"

This has been achieved !!

**Summary**

1. Presented in writing fairly detailed statements on, whether objectives, etc. in TECHNICAL ANNEX were accomplished
2. Claimed verbally the documentation, which prove the stated degree of accomplishment
3. Provided tentative explanation of, why some objectives were not fully met

---

Thank you for 5 years of cooperation !

est@land.aau.dk